

**Approved Minutes of the Meeting of the Impact Assessment Committee (IACOM)
of Heritage Western Cape (HWC) held via MS Teams
at 09H00 on Wednesday, 14 May 2025**



1. Opening and Welcome

The Chair, Mr David Gibbs, officially opened the meeting at 09:00 and welcomed everyone present.

2. Attendance

Members

Mr David Gibbs (DG) (Chair)
Ms Samantha Lee (SL)
Ms Sarah Winter (SW)
Ms Katie Smuts (KS)
Mr John Wilson-Harris (JWH)
Mr Chefferino Fortuin (CF)
Mr Dave Saunders (DS)
Mr Graham Jacobs (GJ) (co-opted)
Ms Emmylou Bailey (EB) (co-opted)
Ms Jenna Lavin (JL) (co-opted)

Staff

Mr Waseefa Dhansay (WD)
Mr Olwethu Dlova (OD)
Ms Stephanie Barnardt (SB)
Ms Corne Nortje (CN)
Ms Yusrah Hoosain (YH)
Ms Colette Scheermeyer (CSc)
Ms Aneeqah Brown (AB)
Ms Xola Mlwandle (XM)
Ms Sofia Vy Menell Briel (SVMB)
Ms Chane Herman (CH)
Emily-Jane Vowles (EJV)
Ms Chiara Singh (CS)

Observers

None

Visitors

Mr Henry Aikman
Ms Alida Pople
Ms Fi Smit
Mr Ron Martin
Ms Berendine Irrgang
Ms Mida Kirova
Ms Ute Kuhlmann
Mr Craig Ormond
Ms Georgie Ravenscroft
Mr Nigel Burls
Ms Ntombekhaya Nkoane
Ms Kelly Novukile
Mr Andrea van Tonder
Ms Wendy Wilson
Mr Jens Horber
Ms Amozelle Lambrechts
Ms Claire Abrahamse
Mr Adriaan Mentz
Ms Ruth Howard

Mr Clive Theunissen
Me Etienne Britz
Ms Cindy Postlethwayt
Ms Bridget O'Donoghue
Mr Faiez Evans
Ms Lindelwa Mabuntane
Ms Samantha Keen
Mr Kobus Meiring
Adv Rod Solomon
Ms Karen White
Ms Debra Roets
Mr Jean Goodall
Mr Daryl Sher
Mr Leonard Heydenrych
Mr Don Connan
Dr Andre van Graan
Ms Heidi Raymer
Ms Ossie Gonsalves
Mr Chris Snelling

Ms Corlea Viljoen
Mr Cillie Malan
Mr Marc Turok
Mr Mark Bell
Mr Rob Young-Pugh
Mr James Nathan
Mr Craig Mason-Jones
Mr Ryan Robinson
Mr Neil Moir
Ms Megan Bamberger
Mr William Pulles
Mr Dylan de Vos
Mr Eugen da Silva
Ms Roschel Naidoo
Mr Neil Basson
Ms Amanda Fritz-Whyte
Mr Dietmar de Klerk
Ms Marelise Botha
Mr Richard Summers

Mr Ian Edwards
Mr Gerard Hillman
Ms Aletia Ritter
Ms Angeline Madonko
Ms Lendy Spires
Mr Nzuzo Wana Radebe
Mr John Buys
Mr Tauriq Jenkins
Mr Andre Wiehahn
Mr Reg Kuen
Mr Bruce Eitzen
Ms Elize Butler
Ms Lisa de Lange
Ms Bianca Mvelase
Mr David Fine
Mr Daneil Tasker
Mr Georina Westraadt
Mr Matodzi Albert Silidi
Mr Ryan David-Anderson

3. Apologies

Dr Antonia Malan (AM)

3.1. Absent

None

4. Approval of the Agenda

4.1 Agenda dated 14 May 2025

The Committee resolved to approve the agenda dated 14 May 2025 with minor changes.

5. Approval of Minutes of Previous Meeting

5.1 Minutes dated 9 April 2025

The Committee reviewed the minutes dated 9 April 2025 and resolved to approve them as circulated without amendments.

6. Disclosure of Interest and acceptance of the code of conduct

- DG: item 13.2 and 13.8;
- KS: item 13.2;
- SW: item 13.2; and
- SL: item 13.2

7. Confidential Matters

7.1 None.

8. Appointments

None

9 Administrative Matters

9.1 Outcome of the Appeals and Tribunal Committees

WD reported back on the following Appeals matters:

- Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 56314, 64 Newlands Road, Claremont
- Proposed Alterations, Additions and Partial Demolition on Erf 168487, 124 Waterkant Street, Cape Town
- Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 1397, Bonne Esperance Boutique Guest House, 17 Van Riebeeck Street, Stellenbosch

9.2 SAHRIS Rollout

HWC has launched the SAHRIS online application process for S38 NID applications.

9.3 Recusals

The Committee nominated DS to chair items 13.2 and 13.8, following the refusal of the Chairperson, Mr David Gibbs, from these items.

10. Standing Items

10.1 Site Inspections Undertaken:

- Proposed Construction of a Packing Shed on Erf 42368, 12 Cecilia Street, Goedemoed Farm, Paarl
- Proposed Development on Erf 26439, Alexandra Road, Oude Molen Eco Village, Pinelands
- Erven 1502329-RE; 156138 (Erven 178896; 178895), 122 Boyes Drive and 7 Carisbrooke Steps, St. James
- Erf 878, Fontein Street, Riebeeck Kasteel, Swartland

10.2 Report back from Council and other Committees

Nothing to report.

10.3 Discussion of the Agenda

For noting.

10.4 Potential/proposed Site Inspections

- Proposed Development on Erf 9013, 29 Morgenster Avenue, Somerset West
- Erven 4507-RE, 4508, & 4509, Nedbank and FNBs, Cnr St Georges Street & Shortmarket Street, Cape Town City Centre
- Farm 1500, Between N1 and Old Paarl Road, Paarl

MATTERS DISCUSSED

11. SECTION 38(2) RESPONSES TO NOTIFICATION OF INTENT TO DEVELOP (NID)

11.1 None

12. SECTION 38(1): INTERIM COMMENT

12.1 None

13. SECTION 38(4) RECORD OF DECISION (ROD)

13.1 Proposed Construction of a Packing Shed on Erf 42368, 12 Cecilia Street, Goedemoed Farm, Paarl: MA HM / CAPE WINELANDS / DRAKENSTEIN / PAARL / ERF 42368

Case No: HWC24080128CN0814

Ms Corne Nortje introduced the case.

The Committee reported back on the site inspection undertaken on Friday, 2 May 2025.

Mr Henry Aikman (heritage consultant) and Mr Clive Theunissen (Drakenstein Municipality) were present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The concern around dominance of packing shed.
- Seasonal variation in landscape.
- Surrounding urban context.
- Three farms worthy of PHS status.
- Packing Shed similar scale of building.
- Setback from previous building and aligned parallel.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The HIA, as prepared by Henry Aikman and dated March 2025, satisfies the requirements of S.38(3) of the NHRA. The Committee endorsed the development and supported the recommendations on page 12 of the HIA, as follows:

1. Rural Setting and Historic farms: The sense of place of the surrounding farms/the retained rural area of the Drakenstein Municipality should not be compromised.
2. Built Form: Reference should be made to the rural landscape and conform to local vernacular in terms of scale, form, and design.
3. Edge Treatment: Screen/shade planting to soften the interface between building platform and landscape context to be used. Views toward the mountains should be maintained. Informal clusters of trees and large shrubs to be used. Visually transparent fencing is required.
4. Lighting: Effective light management needs to be incorporated and integrated into the design to ensure that the visual impact is limited without jeopardising user safety and security.
5. Planting: Tree and shrub planting should be incorporated at the following locations: to offer screening, shade and a softer street character for users of Cecilia Street between the road and

proposed development (packing shed), To offer additional screening for residents of Nancy Hoekstra farm, to provide shade, softening and screening in any hard surfaced areas such as the parking space.

The approvals contained in this decision are valid for 5 years from the date of this decision. This period may be extended on good reason being shown and at the discretion of HWC, provided that application for extension must be made prior to the effluxion of the 5-year period.

CN

13.2 Proposed Development on Erf 26439, Alexandra Road, Oude Molen Eco Village, Pinelands: MA HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN /PINELANDS / ERF 26439

Case No: 21022615SB0330E

DG, SW and KS recused themselves and joined the applicant. The Committee nominated DS to chair this item. JL, GJ, EB joined as members for the item.

Ms Stephanie Barnardt introduced the case.

The Committee reported back on the site inspection undertaken on Friday, 25 April 2025.

Ms Cindy Postlethwayt, Mr Ron Martin, Ms Bridget O'Donoghue, Mr David Gibs, Ms Sarah Winter, Ms Katie Smuts, Ms Berendine Irrgang, Mr Faiez Evans, Ms Mida Kirova, Ms Lindelwa Mabuntane, Ms Ute Kuhlmann, Ms Samantha Keen, Mr Craig Ormond, Mr Kobus Meiring, Ms Georgie Ravenscroft, Adv Andre van Graan, Mr Nigel Burls, Adv Rod Solomon, Mr Tauriq Jenkins, Mr Mark Turok and Reg Kuen were present and took part in the discussion.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee is of the opinion the HIA does not meet the requirements of S.38(3) of the NHRA for the following reasons:

1. The intangible heritage/living heritage has not been sufficiently investigated including how that significance translates tangibly, with reference to S.3.3 of the NHRA.
2. There is insufficient information regarding the significance of the site in relation to the broader TRUP heritage area (macroscale). Further work and detail is required concerning spatial integration with TRUP land.
3. There is insufficient information regarding the interrelated significance of various character areas within the site itself and therefore insufficient information to define precincts and inform precinct specific heritage indicators.
4. More detailed information is required pertaining to the massing of proposed buildings in order to make an accurate assessment of the impact on heritage resources.
5. Additional alternatives are required regarding the nature of interfaces (internal between old and new fabric and external particularly related to TRUP land and Maitland Garden Village) and the underlying rationales supporting those alternatives.

The revised HIA is to be advertised to all Interested and Affected Parties including All First Nation Groups identified in River Club HIA process.

SB

**13.3 Erven 1502329-RE; 156138 (Erven 178896; 178895), 122 Boyes Drive and 7 Carisbrooke Steps, St. James: MA
HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / ST. JAMES / ERVEN 1502329-RE; 156138 (ERVEN 178896; 178895)**

Case No: HWC24050602EJV0324

Emily-Jane Vowles introduced the case.

The Committee reported back on the site inspection undertaken on Friday, 2 May 2025.

Ms Claire Abrahamse (heritage consultant), Mr Mark Bell (CoCT) and Ms Heidi Raymer (owner) were present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site inspection report was tabled.
- CoCT is to be commended for its comments and there has been constructive response with the comments.
- The sea facing gables of Units 4 and 5 must be replaced with hipped roofs.
- The triangular heads to gable windows was a powerful motif. At the risk of having the development look like group housing, this motif should be used sparingly, if at all.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved that the HIA prepared by Claire Abrahamse, dated March 2025 satisfies the requirements of S38(3) of the NHRA. The Committee supports the recommendations of the HIA as follows:

1. The architect must be retained for the design development stages.
2. As design development proceeds, further mitigation should be introduced by ensuring that every structure should be sunk to be as close as possible into the slope.
3. The sea facing gables of Units 4 and 5 must be replaced with hipped roofs.

The approvals contained in this decision are valid for 5 years from the date of this decision. This period may be extended on good reason being shown and at the discretion of HWC, provided that application for extension must be made prior to the effluxion of the 5-year period.

EJV

**13.4 Portion 3 of Erf 177476, Boyes Drive, St James: MA
HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ ST JAMES / ERF 177476**

Case No: 17090415AS0914E

Ms Stephanie Barnardt introduced the case.

Prof Walter Peter (heritage consultant), Ms Cillié Malan (architect) and Mr Mark Bell (CoCT) were present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Dormer window in relation to roofscape was discussed.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the revised design proposals as indicated on drawing number SK_004 Rev F, prepared by Solvation Architect Interior and dated 17 March 2025. Furthermore, the Committee endorsed the Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) dated 30 April 2025, prepared by Walter Peter, as having met the requirements of Section 38(3) of the National Heritage Resources Act (NHRA).

The approvals contained in this decision are valid for 5 years from the date of this decision. This period may be extended on good reason being shown and at the discretion of HWC, provided that application for extension must be made prior to the effluxion of the 5-year period.

SB

**13.5 Proposed Redevelopment on Erf 31990-RE, 23 Main Road, Mowbray: MA
HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ MOWBRAY/ ERF 31990-RE**

Case No: HWC24071109CN0717

Ms Chane Herman introduced the case.

Mr Bruce Wilson (architect), Mr Henry Aikman (heritage consultant), Mr Mark Bell (CoCT) and Mr Daryl Sher were present and took part in the discussion.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the revised design on condition that the double volume structure and framing device on the Rhodes Avenue and Main Road corner of the building be removed to mitigate over massing. Final building plans reflecting these changes are to be submitted to HWC for approval.

The Committee endorsed the HIA as satisfies the requirements of S.38(3) of the NHRA.

The approvals contained in this decision are valid for 5 years from the date of this decision. This period may be extended on good reason being shown and at the discretion of HWC, provided that application for extension must be made prior to the effluxion of the 5-year period.

CH

**13.6 Proposed Development on Erf 9013, 29 Morgenster Avenue, Somerset West: NM
HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ SOMERSET WEST/ ERF 9013**

Case No: HWC24092511CSI1016

HELD OVER:

The Committee resolved to undertake a site inspection on Friday, 23 May 2025 at 09:30 (CF, DG, JWH, KS and SW).

Csi

**13.7 Erf 4269-RE, Aan die Weg, 13 Main Road, Somerset West: NM
HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / SOMERSET WEST / ERF 4269-RE**

Case No: HWC24041203CH0730

Emily-Jane Vowles introduced the case.

Ms Cindy Postlethwayt (heritage consultant) and Mr Rob Young-Pugh (Helderberg Renaissance Foundation) were present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- With respect to hard surfaces tarmac must be avoided.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to endorse the HIA prepared by Cindy Postlethwayt and dated April 2025 as satisfies S.38(3) of the NHRA. The Committee supported the application and the recommendations of the HIA as follows:

1. The development must remain generally in accordance with the proposals included as Annexure D in the HIA report and subject to:
 - a. the implementation of the Landscape Master Plan in all important respects.
 - b. approval in principle of the retention and repurposing of the Barn subject to the submission of a Section 34 application prepared by a recognised Conservation Architect in respect of the detailed alterations and conservation methodology to facilitate such repurposing.
 - c. approval in principle of the retention and repurposing of the homestead subject to the submission of a Section 34 application prepared by a recognised Conservation Architect in respect of the detailed alterations to facilitate such repurposing 3.
2. HWC approves the demolition of the garage structure older than 60 years on the property as indicated on Figure 78 of the HIA report

The approvals contained in this decision are valid for 5 years from the date of this decision. This period may be extended on good reason being shown and at the discretion of HWC, provided that application for extension must be made prior to the effluxion of the 5-year period.

EJW

- 13.8 Erven 4507-RE, 4508, & 4509, Nedbank and FNBs, Cnr St Georges Street & Shortmarket Street, Cape Town City Centre: NM**
HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / CAPE TOWN CITY CENTRE / ERVEN 4507-RE, 4508 & 4509

Case No: HWC24010803SJ0108

HELD OVER:

The Committee resolved to undertake a site inspection on Friday, 23 May 2025 at 11:00 (CF, DG, JWH, KS and SW).

SVMB

14 SECTION 38(8) NEMA RESPONSES TO NOTIFICATION OF INTENT TO DEVELOP

14.1 None

15 SECTION 38(8) NEMA INTERIM COMMENTS

15.1 None

16 SECTION 38(8) NEMA FINAL COMMENTS ON ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT ASSESSMENT

16.1 Erf 878, Fontien Street, Riebeeck Kasteel, Swartland: MA
HM / WEST COAST / SWARTLAND / RIEBEECK KASTEEL / ERF 878

Case No: 20030413SB0603E

GJ joined as a member for this item.

Ms Stephanie Barnardt introduced the case.

The Committee reported back on the site inspection undertaken on 2nd May 2025.

Ms Bridget O'Donoghue (heritage consultant), Mr Bruce Eitzen (VIA specialist), Mr Neil Moir (I&AP) and Mr William Pulles (Riebeeck Ratepayers Association) were present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site inspection report was discussed.
- Experience of containment within topography.
- The Church and topography as primarily structuring element and landmark.
- Rural character of R311 with scenic qualities.
- The elevation of the koppie (hillock) relative to the topography of the village is dominating natural feature.
- The recognition of the great pattern: scale, grain.

INTERIM COMMENT:

The Committee does not support the proposed development in the current format for various reasons. Further requirements to include townscape analysis to inform a planning layout and urban design.

SB

- 16.2 Proposed Development (Runway and associated Infrastructure) on Portion 4 of Farm 474 Joostenbergs Kloof, Portion 10 of Farm 724 Joostenbergs Vlake, The Remainder of Farm 724 Joostenbergs Vlake, Portion 23 of Farm 724 Joostenbergs Vlake, Portion 7 of Farm 942 Kliprug, The Remainder of Farm 474 Joostenbergs Kloof, A portion of Portion 3 of Farm 474 Joostenbergs Kloof, Durbanville: MA
HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / DURBANVILLE/ MULTIPLE FARM PORTIONS**

Case No: HWC23101215SB1102

HELD OVER:

This item will be held over to the Special IACom meeting scheduled for 20 May 2025.

SB

- 16.3 Erven 3075, 3078, 20000, New Eskdale Street, Paarl: NM
CAPE WINELANDS / DRAKENSTEIN / PAARL / ERVEN 3075; 3078; 20000**

Case No: HWC24040303EJV0408

HELD OVER:

This item will be held over to the Special IACom meeting scheduled for 20 May 2025.

EJV

- 16.4 Portion 7 of the Farm Sewesprong No. 168, Ceres Registration Division, near Matjiesfontein: NM
HM / CAPE WINELANDS / WITZENBERG / CERES / PORTION 7 OF THE FARM SEWESPRONG NO. 168**

Case No: HWC25031801SB0318

HELD OVER:

This item will be held over to the Special IACom meeting scheduled for 20 May 2025.

RB

**16.5 Mining Permit & Mining Right on Farm 1029-RE, Malmesbury, Saldanha Bay: MA/NM
HM/ WEST COAST/ SALDANHA BAY/ MALMESBURY / REMAINDER OF FARM 1029**

Case No: HWC24101601CSI1022 & 24101526; HWC24101526CSI1022

HELD OVER:

This item will be held over to the Special IACom meeting scheduled for 20 May 2025.

Csi

**16.6 Carissa Wind Energy South of Beaufort West, along the N12, Central Karoo: NM
HM/ CENTRAL KAROO/ BEAUFORT WEST / VARIOUS FARMS**

Case No: HWC24071217SB0712

HELD OVER:

This item will be held over to the Special IACom meeting scheduled for 20 May 2025.

SB

**16.7 Farm 1500, Between N1 and Old Paarl Road, Paarl: NM/MA
CAPE WINELANDS / DRAKENSTEIN / PAARL / FARM 1500**

Case No: 18102913AS1207E

HELD OVER:

The Committee resolved to undertake a site inspection Friday, 23 May 2025 (JWH, KS and SW).

SB

**17 SECTION 38(8) MPA ENVIRONMENTAL MANAGEMENT PLAN RESPONSES TO NOTIFICATION OF
INTENT TO DEVELOP**

17.1 None

18 SECTION 38(8) MPA ENVIRONMENTAL MANAGEMENT PLAN INTERIM COMMENT

18.1 None

19 SECTION 38(8) MPA ENVIRONMENTAL MANAGEMENT PLAN FINAL COMMENT

19.1 None

20 SECTION 38(8) OTHER LEGISLATION NOTIFICATION OF INTENT TO DEVELOP

20.1 None

21 SECTION 38(8) OTHER LEGISLATION INTERIM COMMENT

21.1 None

22 SECTION 38(8) OTHER LEGISLATION FINAL COMMENT

22.1 None

23. SECTION 27 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITES

23.1 None

24. SECTION 47 CONSERVATION MANAGEMENT PLANS

24.1 None

25. ADVICE

25.1 None

26. SECTION 42 HERITAGE AGREEMENTS

26.1 None

27. OTHER

27.1 None

28. Adoption of decisions and resolutions

The Committee agreed to adopt the decisions and resolutions as recorded above.

29. CLOSURE:

The meeting adjourned at 16:00

30. DATE OF NEXT MEETING:

20 May 2025

MINUTES APPROVED AND SIGNED BY:

CHAIR:

DATE:

SECRETARY:

DATE: